

SUPREME COURT OF INDIA

This file relates to the proposal for appointment of following thirty three Advocates, as Judges of the Allahabad High Court:

- 1 Shri Vipin Chandra Dixit
- 2 Shri Ramanand Pandey
- 3 Shri Prakash Padia
- 4 Shri Alok Mathur
- 5 Shri Pankaj Bhatia
- 6 Shri Saurabh Lavania
- 7 Shri Shekhar Kumar Yadav
- 8 Shri Vivek Prasad Mathur
- 9 Shri Ravi Nath Tilhari
- 10 Shri Sudeep Kumar
- 11 Shri Deepak Verma
- 12 Shri Vivek Varma
- 13 Shri Gautam Chaudhary
- 14 Shri Shamim Ahmed
- 15 Shri Sanjay Kumar Singh
- 16 Shri Piyush Agrawal
- 17 Shri Ramendra Pratap Singh
- 18 Shri Sunil Kumar (Mishra)
- 19 Shri Dinesh Pathak
- 20 Shri Saurabh Shyam Shamsbery
- 21 Shri Jaspreet Singh
- 22 Shri Rajeev Singh
- 23 Shri Manish Kumar
- 24 Smt. Manju Rani Chauhan
- 25 Shri Vivek Ratan Agrawal
- 26 Shri Samit Gopal
- 27 Shri Karunesh Singh Pawar
- 28 Shri Manish Goyal
- 29 Dr. Yogendra Kumar Srivastava
- 30 Shri Manish Mathur
- 31 Shri Rohit Ranjan Agarwal
- 32 Shri Alok Kumar Yadav
- 33 Shri Ashish Pandey

The above recommendation was made by the Chief Justice of the Allahabad High Court on 14th February, 2018, in consultation with his two senior-most colleagues.

We have perused the views of the Chief Minister and the Governor for the State of Uttar Pradesh placed in the file and the observations made therein.

In order to ascertain suitability of the above-named recommendees for elevation to the High Court, we have consulted our colleagues conversant with the affairs of the Allahabad High Court. Copies of letters of opinion of our consultee-colleagues received in this regard are placed below.

For purpose of assessing merit and suitability of the above-named recommendees for elevation to the High Court, we have carefully scrutinized the material placed in the file including the observations made by the Department of Justice therein. Apart from this, we invited all the recommendees with a view to have an interaction with them. On the basis of interaction and having regard to all relevant factors, the Collegium is of the considered view that S/Shri (1) Prakash Padia, (2) Alok Mathur, (3) Pankaj Bhatia, (4) Saurabh Lavania, (5) Vivek Varma, (6) Shamim Ahmed, (7) Sanjay Kumar Singh, (8) Piyush Agrawal, (9) Ramendra Pratap Singh, (10) Saurabh Shyam Shamsbery, (11) Jaspreet Singh, (12) Rajeev Singh, (13) Smt. Manju Rani Chauhan, (14) Karunesh Singh Pawar, (15) Dr. Yogendra Kumar Srivastava, (16) Manish Mathur, and (17) Rohit Ranjan Agarwal, Advocates (mentioned at Sl.Nos. 3, 4, 5, 6, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 20, 21, 22, 24, 27, 29, 30, and 31 above) are suitable for being appointed as Judges of the Allahabad High Court.

As regards S/Shri (1) Vipin Chandra Dixit, (2) Ramanand Pandey, (3) Shekhar Kumar Yadav, (4) Vivek Prasad Mathur (5) Ravi Nath Tilhari, (6) Sudeep Kumar, (7) Deepak Verma, (8) Gautam Chaudhary, (9) Sunil Kumar (Mishra), (10) Dinesh Pathak, (11) Manish Kumar, (12) Vivek Ratan Agrawal, (13) Samit Gopal, (14) Manish Goyal, (15) Alok Kumar Yadav, and (16) Ashish Pandey, Advocates (mentioned at Sl. Nos. 1, 2, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 13, 18, 19, 23, 25, 26, 28, 32, & 33 above), having regard to the material on record and all relevant factors, the Collegium is of the considered view that their cases deserve to be deferred. The proposal in respect of S/Shri (1) Shekhar Kumar Yadav, (2) Deepak Verma, (3) Gautam Chaudhary, (4) Dinesh Pathak, (5) Manish Kumar, (6) Samit

Gopal, (7) Manish Goyal, and (8) Alok Kumar Yadav, Advocates would be taken up for consideration by the Collegium after some time.

We have also taken note of the complaints placed in the file as also received in the office of Chief Justice of India making allegations against some of the above-named recommendees. On examination, we do not find any *prima facie* substance in these complaints, which deserve to be ignored.

In view of the above, the Collegium resolves to recommend that S/Shri (1) Prakash Padia, (2) Alok Mathur, (3) Pankaj Bhatia, (4) Saurabh Lavania, (5) Vivek Varma, (6) Shamim Ahmed, (7) Sanjay Kumar Singh, (8) Piyush Agrawal, (9) Ramendra Pratap Singh, (10) Saurabh Shyam Shamsbery, (11) Jaspreet Singh, (12) Rajeev Singh, (13) Smt. Manju Rani Chauhan, (14) Karunesh Singh Pawar, (15) Dr. Yogendra Kumar Srivastava, (16) Manish Mathur, and (17) Rohit Ranjan Agarwal, Advocates be appointed as Judges of the Allahabad High Court. Their *inter se* seniority be fixed as per the existing practice.

(Dipak Misra) CJI

(Ranjan Gogoi), CJI - Designate

(Madan B. Lokur), J.

September 25, 2018.

